

**Report on Tibet Negotiations**

**As Required by**

**Foreign Relations Authorization Act, 2003**

**Section 611, "Tibetan Policy Act of 2002"**

Report on Tibet Negotiations  
March 2009 – February 2010

As Required by  
Foreign Relations Authorization Act, 2003  
Section 611, “Tibetan Policy Act of 2002”

I. Executive Summary

II. Tibet Policy

III. Steps taken by the President and the Secretary of State to encourage the government of the People’s Republic of China (PRC) to enter into a dialogue with the Dalai Lama or his representatives leading to a negotiated agreement on Tibet.

IV. Status of Discussions between the PRC and the Dalai Lama’s representatives.

Appendix. History of Discussions between the PRC and the Dalai Lama’s representatives.

## **I. Executive Summary**

The Dalai Lama's Special Envoys and Chinese officials from the United Front Work Department (UFWD) met for the ninth round of dialogue at the end of January 2010. The United States welcomed the resumption of the dialogue, which had not taken place since November 2008. While there were no concrete results from these meetings, they were reportedly conducted in a better atmosphere than the most recent rounds. The United States continues to encourage both sides to engage in a substantive discussion that will work to achieve concrete results.

The U.S. government believes that the Dalai Lama can be a constructive partner for China as it deals with the difficult challenge of continuing tensions in Tibetan areas. His views are widely reflected within Tibetan society, and he commands the respect of the vast majority of Tibetans. His consistent advocacy of non-violence is an important principle for making progress toward a lasting solution. China's engagement with the Dalai Lama or his representatives to resolve problems facing Tibetans is in the interests of both the Chinese government and the Tibetan people. Failure to address these problems will lead to greater tensions inside China and will be an impediment to China's social and economic development.

## **II. Tibet Policy**

Encouraging substantive dialogue between Beijing and the Dalai Lama is an important foreign policy objective of the United States. We continue to encourage representatives of the PRC and the Dalai Lama to hold direct and substantive discussions aimed at the resolution of differences, without preconditions. The Administration believes that such a dialogue may lead to a solution to or provide the best hope for alleviating tensions in Tibetan areas and contribute to the overall stability of China.

The resumption of the dialogue in 2010 was a positive step, but we are disappointed that eight years of talks have not borne concrete results. We are concerned that in 2009 the PRC continued its negative rhetoric about the Dalai Lama, as well as repression and religious restrictions in Tibetan areas. We continue to urge both sides to engage in substantive dialogue and hope to see a tenth round of dialogue that will lead to positive movement on questions related to Tibetans' lives and livelihoods.

The United States, together with many in the international community, recognizes the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) and Tibetan autonomous prefectures and counties in other provinces as part of the PRC. The Dalai Lama has expressly and repeatedly disclaimed any intention to seek sovereignty or independence for Tibet and has stated that he wants China to preserve Tibetan culture, religion, and its fragile environment through genuine autonomy. We consistently urge China to respect the unique religious, linguistic, and cultural heritage of its Tibetan people and to respect fully their human rights and civil liberties, as well as the human rights and civil liberties of all citizens of China.

Since the U.S. government does not recognize Tibet as an independent state, the United States does not conduct official diplomatic relations with the Tibetan “government-in-exile” in Dharamsala, India. We maintain contact with representatives of a wide variety of political and non-political groups including Tibetans in the United States, China, and around the world. U.S. government officials have also met with the Dalai Lama in his capacity as an important religious leader and Nobel laureate. Most recently, President Obama and Secretary Clinton met him in February 2010.

### **III. Steps Taken by the President and the Secretary**

Publicly and privately, President Obama has called for substantive dialogue between the Dalai Lama’s representatives and the PRC to resolve long-standing issues, consistent with the policy of previous U.S. Administrations.

During a meeting with Chinese Foreign Minister Yang Jiechi at the White House on March 12, 2009, President Obama emphasized the importance of continued dialogue between the PRC and the Dalai Lama’s representatives and expressed his hope that there would be progress. On April 1, 2009, during the G-20 Summit, President Obama met President Hu and raised Tibet, expressing his desire for progress in the dialogue between the Dalai Lama’s representatives and the PRC. In his opening remarks at the U.S.-China Strategic and Economic Dialogue on July 27, 2009, President Obama emphasized the importance of protecting the religion, culture, and free expression of ethnic and religious minorities in China, a direct reference to Tibetans and other minority groups.

In November 2009, President Obama traveled to China. During a November 17, 2009, meeting with President Hu, President Obama made clear his respect for the Dalai Lama as a cultural and religious leader and emphasized his concerns about human rights in Tibet. He also indicated his intention to meet with the Dalai Lama at a future date despite Chinese objections. In a joint press appearance following the meeting, President Obama urged an early resumption of the dialogue between the PRC and the Dalai Lama's representatives to resolve concerns and differences.

On February 18, 2010, President Obama received the Dalai Lama at the White House. During their meeting, President Obama expressed his strong support for the preservation of Tibet's unique religious, cultural, and linguistic identity, and the protection of human rights for Tibetans in China. He also commended the Dalai Lama's "Middle Way" approach, commitment to nonviolence, and the pursuit of dialogue with the PRC. During the meeting, the President and the Dalai Lama agreed on the importance of a positive and cooperative relationship between the United States and China.

Secretary Clinton has consistently called for the protection of human rights in Tibet and for further dialogue between the the Dalai Lama's representatives and the PRC, in meetings with her PRC counterparts and in public speeches. On March 11, 2009, Secretary Clinton met FM Yang Jiechi and stated her concerns about human rights in Tibet. In a subsequent press briefing, she emphasized that a mutual and collective commitment to human rights was as important to bettering the world as other issues of bilateral interest, such as security, economic, energy, and climate change.

While in Thailand as part of a visit to Asia in July 2009, Secretary Clinton publicly reaffirmed U.S. support for increased autonomy for the Tibetan people, greater respect for Tibet's religious and cultural traditions, and continued dialogue between the PRC and the Dalai Lama and his representatives. Secretary Clinton highlighted the importance of protecting Tibetans during her December 14, 2009, speech on human rights at Georgetown University when she said, "We call for protection of rights of minorities in Tibet and Xinjiang; for the rights to express oneself and worship freely; and for civil society and religious organizations to advocate their positions within a framework of the rule of law."

Secretary Clinton met the Dalai Lama at the State Department on February 18, 2010. The meeting was attended by Undersecretary of State for Democracy and Global Affairs Maria Otero, in her role as the Special Coordinator for Tibetan Issues, along with Assistant Secretary of State for East Asia and the Pacific Kurt

Campbell. During this meeting, the Secretary reaffirmed the U.S. commitment to the preservation of Tibetan language, culture, and religion, as well as continued support for dialogue between the Dalai Lama's representatives and the PRC.

Senior officials in the Administration and at the Department of State have repeatedly raised the importance of Tibetan issues and urged PRC officials and the Dalai Lama or his representatives to continue their dialogue.

On October 1, 2009, Secretary Clinton designated Maria Otero as Special Coordinator for Tibetan Issues, in addition to her continuing role as Under Secretary of State for Democracy and Global Affairs. As the Special Coordinator for Tibetan Issues, Under Secretary Otero's responsibilities include promoting substantive dialogue between the PRC and the Dalai Lama or his representatives and assisting in preserving the unique cultural, religious, and linguistic heritage of Tibetans.

Under Secretary Otero has met the Dalai Lama three times. First, in September 2009 when she accompanied Valerie Jarrett, the Senior Advisor and Special Assistant to the President for Intergovernmental Affairs and Public Engagement, to Dharamsala, India, to brief the Dalai Lama about the Administration's approach to Tibet and to invite him to the United States after the President had completed his trip to Asia. During the meeting, Senior Advisor Jarrett said that President Obama praised the Dalai Lama for "being consistent in looking for a solution based on Tibetan autonomy within the People's Republic of China." During this trip, Senior Advisor Jarrett and Under Secretary Otero also met with members of the Tibetan refugee population, including senior officials and former political prisoners. They also visited U.S. government-funded programs.

Under Secretary Otero welcomed the Dalai Lama when he visited Washington in October 2009. The two discussed follow-up measures from the September trip, ongoing human rights concerns in Tibet, and the status of dialogue between the Dalai Lama's representatives and the PRC. Under Secretary Otero also met the Dalai Lama in February 2010 following his meetings with the President and Secretary Clinton. They discussed the status of the most recent dialogue between his representatives and the PRC as well as the situation in Tibet.

During 2009, senior U.S. officials met with the Dalai Lama's Special Envoy, Lodi Gyari, including NSC Senior Director for Asian Affairs Jeffrey Bader and Senior Advisor Jarrett. Under Secretary Maria Otero has met with Mr. Gyari seven times since becoming Under Secretary in August 2009. Mr. Gyari has also met with

other senior officials at the State Department, including Deputy Secretary of State James Steinberg and Assistant Secretary Campbell. Assistant Secretary of State for Democracy, Human Rights, and Labor Michael H. Posner met Mr. Gyari in early 2010.

During the reporting period, Deputy Secretary Steinberg and Assistant Secretary Campbell raised the issue of human rights in Tibet on multiple occasions while in China. Prior to assuming his duties in China, then- U.S. Ambassador-designate to China Jon Huntsman emphasized the importance of Tibet as a human rights priority and indicated that he would encourage meaningful dialogue leading to improvements in the lives of Tibetans. Since his confirmation, Amb. Huntsman has continuously engaged the PRC on Tibet. He has also ensured that the U.S. Embassy in Beijing and the U.S. Consulate General in Chengdu regularly raise U.S. concerns about the human rights and religious freedom situation in Tibetan areas with Chinese officials. U.S. officials attempt to travel regularly to the Tibet Autonomous Region (TAR) and Tibetan areas in other provinces of China to ascertain living conditions, raise human rights concerns, urge Chinese authorities to engage in dialogue with the Dalai Lama or his representatives, and support the protection of the cultural, religious, and linguistic heritage of Tibetans. However, access to some Tibetan areas remains limited.

#### **IV. Status of Discussions between the PRC and the Dalai Lama's Representatives**

Dialogue between representatives of the Dalai Lama and the PRC's UFWD began in September 2002, with meetings in May 2003, September 2004, June 2005, February 2006, and late June/early July 2007. In May 2008, there was an informal meeting to discuss moving forward after the protests and riots across Tibet, and rounds in July and November.

The tone and tenor following the eighth round in November 2008 was probably the most tense since both sides re-engaged in dialogue in 2002. PRC officials said on November 10, 2008 that the Memorandum on Genuine Autonomy for the Tibetan People presented by the Tibetans showed they had "not given up their dream of independence" and that it contained proposals that were unacceptable. The Dalai Lama expressed frustration with the dialogue and said that "my trust in the Chinese government has become thinner, thinner, and thinner."

After a hiatus of almost 15 months, the Dalai Lama's representatives and UFWD officials held their ninth round of dialogue in January 2010 in Beijing. Lodi Gyari

and Kelsang Gyalsten met Executive Vice Minister Zhu Weiqun and Vice Minister Sitar on January 31, 2010. They also met again with Du Qinglin, Minister of the UFWD and Vice Chairman of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Conference on January 30. This round of dialogue was preceded by a trip to Hunan Province beginning on January 26 to visit Mao's birthplace and to better understand China's regional ethnic autonomy policy.

Before departing for Hunan, the Tibetans presented to UFWD a "Note" relating to the 2008 "Memorandum on Genuine Autonomy for the Tibetan People." The Note contained seven points that clarified issues and concerns raised by the Chinese during the eighth round. These points are: 1) respect for the sovereignty of territorial integrity of the People's Republic of China; 2) respect for the Constitution of the PRC; 3) respect for the "three adherences" (adherence to the Communist Party of China's leadership, the socialist path with Chinese characteristics, and the regional autonomy system for ethnic minorities); 4) respect for the authority of the Chinese Central government; 5) clarifications on the Memorandum concerning public security, language, regulation of population migration, religion, single administration and the political, social and economic system; 6) recognition of the core issue by stating that the Dalai Lama and other members of the exiled leadership have no personal demands to make; and 7) the Dalai Lama's offer of cooperation for a mutually beneficial solution. The Note also stated that the fundamental issue that needs to be resolved, according to the Tibetans, is the faithful implementation of genuine autonomy that will enable the Tibetan people to govern themselves in accordance with their own needs.

During the dialogue, PRC officials presented the Tibetans with four "not to indulge in" principles, which are: 1) the national interests must not be violated; 2) the principles of the Constitution must not be infringed; 3) the national dignity must not be damaged; and 4) the universal desires of various ethnic groups of the people must not be defied. They also briefed the Tibetans on recent developments in Tibet and with information concerning the Fifth Tibet Work Forum.

The Fifth Tibet Work Forum, which took place from January 18-20, 2010, was presided over by the nine-member Standing Committee of the Politburo of the Central Committee of the Chinese Communist Party and attended by 332 PRC officials representing the Communist Party, central government, Tibet Autonomous Region, other provincial-level areas, the People's Liberation Army, and others. The Forum established as a priority improving the livelihood of Tibetans in the Tibet Autonomous Region and other Tibetan areas, specifically in the areas of education, medical care, and environmental protection. The Tibetans



welcomed the fact that the Forum discussed development issues in all Tibetan areas, not just in the TAR, for the first time. They also welcomed the discussion of issues related to improving the lives of all Tibetans.

During a February 2 press conference about the talks, Zhu mentioned the Memorandum and said that the Dalai Lama's representatives had refused to "revise a single word." Zhu reported that the two sides had "sharply divided" views in the latest round of talks "as usual." He also said that the talks "had some upside," allowing both sides to know the exact differences and how wide they were.

Lodi Gyari told reporters following the talks that "we had very candid discussions ... we have a good rapport, so that is always very helpful." The Tibetans also said that they will be studying the issues raised by their counterparts including the Fifth Tibet Work Forum and the "Four Not to Indulge In" points and hope the Chinese leadership will reflect on the issues they raised.

The United States was pleased to see the dialogue resume in 2010 after a hiatus of almost 15 months. We note following this round of dialogue the Tibetans expressed less pessimism than they had after previous rounds. While progress was minimal, resumption of the dialogue was a positive development. The United States government will continue to work on this issue and encourage both sides to engage in substantive dialogue. We hope that another round will be scheduled soon and will include a substantive discussion that will lead to solutions to the problems that Tibet and its people face.

### **History of Discussions between PRC and the Dalai Lama's Representatives**

The last three decades have seen intermittent efforts by the Dalai Lama and the PRC to reach accommodation through dialogue. During a period of liberalization in the TAR inaugurated in 1980 by then-Secretary General of the Communist Party Hu Yaobang, the Dalai Lama was invited to send several delegations to China to observe conditions in Tibetan areas. Three delegations traveled through Tibetan areas between August 1979 and July 1980, and one delegation visited in 1985. Talks between Beijing and Tibetan delegations in April 1982 and October 1984 did not make substantive headway.

Contacts between China and the Dalai Lama's representatives continued sporadically for the next 17 years, but a visit by a senior Tibetan figure did not occur again until July 2002, when China invited Gyalo Thondup, the Dalai Lama's older brother, to visit Lhasa, Beijing, his family home in Qinghai, and the Xinjiang

Uighur Autonomous Region in northwest China. Upon his return to India, he expressed optimism over the “great changes in the outlook of the Chinese government” and urged face-to-face talks between Tibetan and Chinese leaders.

In September 2002, Special Envoy Lodi Gyari and Envoy Kelsang Gyaltzen led a four-member delegation to Lhasa, Shigatse, Chengdu, Shanghai, and Beijing. The visit, hosted by UFWD, marked the first public travel of Lodi Gyari to China since 1984, when he visited Beijing. It also marked the first formal contact between the Dalai Lama’s representatives and China since 1993. Lodi Gyari later stated that the delegation had three tasks on the trip: “to re-establish direct contact with the leadership in Beijing and to create a conducive atmosphere enabling direct face-to-face meetings on a regular basis in the future; and to explain His Holiness the Dalai Lama’s Middle Way Approach towards resolving the issue of Tibet.”

In a September 2002 briefing, Chinese Ministry of Foreign Affairs (MFA) spokesperson Kong Quan welcomed their visit and noted that “it is also helpful for the expatriates to witness the religious freedom of Tibetans. China believes that in recent years, the Dalai Lama has used support provided by international organizations to engage in separatist activities.” Kong stressed that the Dalai Lama must cease those activities and accept that Tibet and Taiwan are parts of China.

Lodi Gyari and Kelsang Gyaltzen traveled to China again from May 25 to June 8, 2003. Their party traveled to Jiangsu and Zhejiang Provinces, the Tibetan areas of Yunnan Province, and to Beijing and Shanghai Municipalities. In a press statement released after the visit, Lodi Gyari stated, “We have been able to meet officials of various levels of the provinces we visited and exchanged views in a warm atmosphere.” Regarding the envoys’ travel to Dechen Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture in Yunnan Province, he said, “Our visit was too short for us to assess in an adequate manner how effectively the Tibetan language, culture, religion, and identity are being preserved, protected, and promoted.”

MFA spokesperson Kong Quan said in a press conference that Beijing approved of Tibetan “compatriots” visiting China in a private capacity and stated that their visit illustrated that the PRC maintained channels of communication with the Dalai Lama.

Lodi Gyari and Kelsang Gyaltzen traveled to China for a third time in September 2004. They visited Beijing, Hebei, and Guangdong, and several counties of the Kardze Tibetan Autonomous Prefecture in western Sichuan Province, including Lodi Gyari’s hometown. The envoys were again hosted by UFWD and met with

UFWD head and Vice Chairperson of the Chinese People's Political Consultative Committee Minister Liu Yandong and other officials. Lodi Gyari issued a statement after the visit noting that they had "so far the most extensive and serious exchange of views on matters relating to Tibet," conducted in "a frank but cordial atmosphere." He noted that "both sides acknowledged the need for more substantive discussions in order to narrow down the gaps and reach a common ground."

Former Chinese Assistant FM Shen Guofang described the 2004 talks as "useful and beneficial." As with the previous visits, the MFA spokesperson again described the visit as "some Tibetan expatriates allowed to come back to China in a private capacity" and welcomed the visit as a chance "to see for themselves the development of Tibet and other Tibetan autonomous areas of China." The spokesperson reiterated China's opposition to a visit by the Dalai Lama, saying that he was engaged in "splittist activities." If the Dalai Lama ceased these activities, recognized Tibet and Taiwan as part of China, and admitted that the government of the People's Republic of China was the sole legitimate government representing all of China, then China would be willing to have direct consultations with him "on his personal future."

From June 30 to July 1, 2005, Lodi Gyari and Kelsang Gyalsten again met with a delegation of Chinese officials in Bern, Switzerland, led by Vice Foreign Minister Zhu Weiqun, Deputy Head of the UFWD. This was the first meeting held between the two sides outside of China. Gyari described the discussions as concrete and substantive, although many differences still remained.

From February 15-23, 2006, the Dalai Lama's envoys met with PRC officials in Guilin, Guangxi Autonomous Region. The location was chosen in response to the envoys' requests in previous meetings to visit other autonomous regions of China. After the meetings concluded, Lodi Gyari reported that there was "a growing understanding between the two sides, though fundamental differences persisted." However, he made clear that the Tibetans remained committed to the dialogue process and were hopeful that progress would be possible through continuing engagement.

The UFWD hosted the Dalai Lama's envoys in Shanghai and Nanjing from June 29 to July 5, 2007. Following this meeting, the envoys reported that "our dialogue process has reached a critical stage" and that "we ...made some concrete proposals for implementation if our dialogue process is to go forward."

On May 4, 2008, Lodi Gyari and Kelsang Gyalsten met with Executive Vice Minister Zhu Weiqun and Vice Minister Sitar of the UFWD in Shenzhen. This informal meeting was held to discuss the current situation in Tibet following weeks of protests and unrest across Tibetan areas. When discussing the meeting, the Tibetans reported that they rejected the claims by the PRC officials that the Dalai Lama was responsible for instigating the demonstrations and that he was trying to sabotage the Olympic Games; emphasized that the events in Tibet were the consequences of “wrong policies;” and called for the release of prisoners, proper medical treatment for the injured, unfettered access to visitors, and an end to the “patriotic re-education campaigns.” In his summary of the meeting, Foreign Ministry Spokesman Qin Gang reported that “they talked about the ‘March 14’ incident, the current situation in Lhasa, the Central government’s policy on Tibet, and towards the Dalai Lama.” At the conclusion of the meeting, both sides agreed that a date would be set soon for the next round of formal dialogue.

The seventh round of dialogue took place from July 1-2 in Beijing. Lodi Gyari and Kelsang Gyalsten again met with Zhu Weiqun and Sitar. They also met for the first time with Du Qinglin, Vice Chairman of the Chinese People’s Political Consultative Conference and Minister of the UFWD. During this round, the Chinese presented the Tibetans with a set of new preconditions on dialogue, called the “four no-supports,” stating that the Dalai Lama must not support: 1) any attempt to disrupt the 2008 Beijing Olympics; 2) incitements to violence in Tibet, including protests; 3) the alleged “terrorist activities” of a Tibetan NGO; or 4) Tibetan independence. The Chinese insisted that the Dalai Lama should “promise” to fulfill these requirements and “prove it in his actions.” The Tibetans stated that “His Holiness and the Tibetan struggle are universally acknowledged...as opposing such acts.” In their response, the Tibetans reported their rejection of violence and their insistence that the issue under discussion was the welfare of the Tibetan people and not the personal status of the Dalai Lama or the Tibetans in exile.

During the eighth round of talks from October 31 to November 5 in Beijing, the Tibetan representatives met with UFWD counterparts and with Du Qinglin, Vice Chairman of the Chinese People’s Political Consultative Conference. The Tibetans presented the Chinese with a document entitled, “Memorandum on Genuine Autonomy for the Tibetan People,” which clarified their understanding of the meaning of “genuine autonomy.” The document had been requested during the July meeting.

The 11-page document laid out in detail the Tibetans’ notion of genuine autonomy for a large range of issues including language, cultural, religion, education,

environmental protection, economic development and trade, public health, public security, and regulation of population migration. The memorandum stated that it is their intention “to explore how the needs of the Tibetan nationality can be met within the framework of the PRC since we believe these needs are consistent with the principles of the [Chinese] Constitution on autonomy.” It also stated that the Tibetans “have no intention at all of using any agreement on genuine autonomy as stepping stone for separation from the PRC.”

During the meeting, Du Qinglin briefed the Tibetans on the Olympics, the Paralympics, the economic and social development in the TAR and the country at large, and relief efforts for the earthquake in Sichuan and for the January snowstorms that crippled southern China. After the talks, Du said the Dalai Lama should respect history, face reality, and conform to the times, as well as fundamentally change his political positions. The tone and tenor following the eighth round was the worst from both sides since they reengaged in dialogue in 2002. PRC officials said that the “Memorandum on Genuine Autonomy for the Tibetan People” presented by the Tibetans showed they had not given up their dream of independence and that it contained proposals that were unacceptable.

The Dalai Lama expressed frustration with the dialogue while on a trip to Japan in early November and said that “my trust in the Chinese government has become thinner, thinner, and thinner.” As a result of the concern of the direction of the dialogue, Tibet’s government in exile held a meeting in Dharamsala, India with hundreds of Tibetans leaders to debate whether to continue to pursue a measured path of compromise with China or if another path should be taken. After five days of deliberation, the majority of Tibetans decided not to break with Dalai Lama’s vision of finding a peaceful solution to Tibet within the framework of the People’s Republic of China. There was also a strong endorsement of the Dalai Lama’s continued leadership.